



Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>

submitting a manuscript

8 messages

Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>

Wed, Sep 2, 2020 at 2:57 PM

To: Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu>

Cc: Ahmad Maryudi <ahmad_maryudi@ugm.ac.id>, Dwiko Budi Permadi <dbpermadi@ugm.ac.id>, "Muhammad Alif K. Sahide" <alif.mksr@gmail.com>

Dear Editor,

I am writing to submit our manuscript (attached files) entitled, "Palm Oil Plantation, Forest Conservation and Indigenous People in West Papua; What Lies Ahead," for consideration for publication in the Journal of Forest and Society. Since our manuscript related to a special section of the Journal, hopefully, it would draw the interest of society who read your journal.

This manuscript describes our work and is not under consideration by any other journal. All authors approved the manuscript and this submission.

Thank you for receiving our manuscript and considering it for review. We appreciate your time and look forward to your response.

Kind regards,
on behalf of all authors,

Yubelince Runtuboi
(Corresponding author)

2 attachments**Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua Province_02092020.docx**
198K**Cover letter.docx**
166K

Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu>

Thu, Sep 3, 2020 at 10:25 AM

To: Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>

Cc: Ahmad Maryudi <ahmad_maryudi@ugm.ac.id>, Dwiko Budi Permadi <dbpermadi@ugm.ac.id>, "Muhammad Alif K. Sahide" <alif.mksr@gmail.com>

Dear Authors,

Thank you for your interest in our journal and for the submission of this timely topic.

I will be the handling editor for this journal. We have conducted an editorial desk review of the submission and have decided to proceed with our peer review process.

Please know that we will try to ensure a speedy turnaround on the review.

In the meantime, if you have any additional questions, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Many thanks,
Micah

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

<Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua Province_02092020.docx><Cover letter.docx>

Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu>

Thu, Oct 29, 2020 at 2:05 PM

To: Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>

Cc: Ahmad Maryudi <ahmad_maryudi@ugm.ac.id>, Dwiko Budi Permadi <dbpermadi@ugm.ac.id>, "Muhammad Alif K. Sahide" <alif.mksr@gmail.com>

Dear Authors,

Thank you for your timely submission of this policy brief.

We have received two reviewer comments for your submission.

Given these encouraging reviews, as editor, I have decided to accept your article with minor submissions. I also provided some additional copy editing directly in the draft in anticipation of publication, attached:

Please find the reviewer comments attached directly in the form as track changes, as well as some overall comments listed below:

Many thanks, and we look forward to your resubmission.

Micah

REVIEWER 1

Introduction:

Need to better explain the distinction on the geography of oil palm plantations. As they are mostly using lowland tropical forest, therefore they result in significant losses of biodiversity. Please expand on this point to provide better context.

In addition – please include additional data about plants and animals which are at most risk.

You should also seek to be more specific about why oil palm plantations are expanding in West Papua? Why are they increasing and what are the processes that result in the rapid increase in recent years?

How is the West Papua commitment as “Provinsi Konservasi ” in terms of reviewing these licensing procedures and approvals, especially on oil palm plantation?

Does the government have a strong commitment or lack the capacity for concession processes, and why are they promoting oil palm concessions? Can you also expand more on the internal conflicts within the government on plantation approval or those against it?

Why are local governments not promoting other forms of concessions that might be more locally appropriate, such as developing local products such as Sago, Casava, Taro, or buah merah, rather than choosing oil palm plantation?

In section 2:

The data on conflict is interesting but could do a better job of listing out additional conflicts.

Here is some additional information:

-Conflict Between Pt Mitra Silva Lestari, PT Papua Sawit permai and contradicting concession area with local people and local government in Manokwari selatan)

-also Awyu Ethnic group in Boven Digoel demonstrated on 28 Agustus 2020 to ask the Bupati Boven digoel to stop oil plantations. Those company areas include: PT Indo Asiana Lestari, Pt Graha Kencana Mulia, PT Kartika Cipta Pratama, PT Boven Digoel Budiaya Sentosa, Pt Boven Digeol Abadi, PT Perkebunan Digeol Sejahtera)

REVIEWER 2:

Thank you for this excellent contribution to the literature on a topic we know very little about. This article provides timely engagement on a topic with little empirical material and does a good job of drawing attention to the issue. We

hope that this policy forum paper will help to draw attention and encourage more research on this topic.

Overall the article is in a very good condition to merit publication, especially as a policy forum article.

However, there are some key areas that would help to improve the paper.

1) There are key sections of missed pronouns "it" which create confusion on the subject of the sentence. Please try to be clearer on which perspective or points are being raised here. I have noted most of these directly in the attached text.

2) The paper would also benefit from adding additional case studies. Particularly on the issues of customary conflicts, the points would be significantly improved by case examples. I have also noted these throughout the text.

3) There is one fundamental area for improvement for the paper that should be the focus of the revision process. I make this suggestion in two parts. The first emerges from a claim in the conclusion:
a. "The development of oil palm under the pretext of poverty alleviation therefore tends to jeopardize the role, authority, and the overall existence of indigenous Papuans." Can you give more concrete evidence of this in the text. While I agree, after reading your paper I am still left wonder at: How did you arrive at this conclusion?
b. Similarly, you make this statement: "Oil palm expansion in West Papua has increasingly been seen to undermine goals laid in the Special Autonomy Law. The rapid growth of oil palm in West Papua is not accompanied by good governance, recognition, and capacity building of indigenous Papuans." Can you be more explicit in the text on how you arrived at this conclusion?

4) A final point I would like the authors to consider. In the second paragraph (intro) you mention that you will do three things in the paper. Did you deliver on all of these points? A more critical eye on this question could provide improved ideas for structure and empirical engagement in the paper.

On Sep 2, 2020, at 15:57, Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Editor,

I am writing to submit our manuscript (attached files) entitled, "Palm Oil Plantation, Forest Conservation and Indigenous People in West Papua; What Lies Ahead," for consideration for publication in the Journal of Forest and Society. Since our manuscript related to a special section of the Journal, hopefully, it would draw the interest of society who read your journal.

This manuscript describes our work and is not under consideration by any other journal. All authors approved the manuscript and this submission.

Thank you for receiving our manuscript and considering it for review. We appreciate your time and look forward to your response.

Kind regards,
on behalf of all authors,

Yubelince Runtuboi
(Corresponding author)
<Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua Province_02092020.docx><Cover letter.docx>



Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua Province_02092020 _with reviewer comments 1 and 2.docx

214K

Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>
To: Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu>

Thu, Nov 19, 2020 at 5:06 PM

Cc: Ahmad Maryudi <ahmad_maryudi@ugm.ac.id>, Dwiko Budi Permadi <dbpermadi@ugm.ac.id>, "Muhammad Alif K. Sahide" <alif.mksr@gmail.com>

Dear the Editor,

On behalf of all authors, I would like to submit the revised version of our paper. I would like to sincerely thank you for the constructive comments provided. The details of how we revised the paper provided in a separate sheer (response to reviewers). We are confident the paper is in a better shape now. We are looking forward to receiving a positive decision. Thank you.

Sincerely,
Authors

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

Please find the reviewer comments attached directly in the form as track changes, as well as some overall comments listed below:

Many thanks, and we look forward to your resubmission.

Micah

REVIEWER 1

Introduction:

Need to better explain the distinction on the geography of oil palm plantations. As they are mostly using lowland tropical forest, therefore they result in significant losses of biodiversity. Please expand on this point to provide better context.

In addition – please include additional data about plants and animals which are at most risk.

You should also seek to be more specific about why oil palm plantations are expanding in West Papua? Why are they increasing and what are the processes that result in the rapid increase in recent years?

How is the West Papua commitment as “Provinsi Konservasi ” in terms of reviewing these licensing procedures and approvals, especially on oil palm plantation?

Does the government have a strong commitment or lack the capacity for concession processes, and why are they promoting oil palm concessions? Can you also expand more on the internal conflicts within the government on plantation approval or those against it?

Why are local governments not promoting other forms of concessions that might be more locally appropriate, such as developing local products such as Sago, Casava, Taro, or buah merah, rather than choosing oil palm plantation?

In section 2:

The data on conflict is interesting but could do a better job of listing out additional conflicts.

Here is some additional information:

-Conflict Between Pt Mitra Silva Lestari, PT Papua Sawit permai and contradicting concession area with local people and local government in Manokwari selatan)

-also Awyu Ethnic group in Boven Digoel demonstrated on 28 Agustus 2020 to ask the Bupati Boven digoel to stop oil plantations. Those company areas include: PT Indo Asiana Lestari, Pt Graha Kencana Mulia, PT Kartika Cipta Pratama, PT Boven Digoel Budiaya Sentosa, Pt Boven Digeol Abadi, PT Perkebunan Digeol Sejahtera)

REVIEWER 2:

Thank you for this excellent contribution to the literature on a topic we know very little about. This article provides timely engagement on a topic with little empirical material and does a good job of drawing attention to the issue. We hope that this policy forum paper will help to draw attention and encourage more research on this topic.

Overall the article is in a very good condition to merit publication, especially as a policy forum article.

However, there are some key areas that would help to improve the paper.

- 1) There are key sections of missed pronouns "it" which create confusion on the subject of the sentence. Please try to be clearer on which perspective or points are being raised here. I have noted most of these directly in the attached text.
- 2) The paper would also benefit from adding additional case studies. Particularly on the issues of customary conflicts, the points would be significantly improved by case examples. I have also noted these throughout the text.
- 3) There is one fundamental area for improvement for the paper that should be the focus of the revision process. I make this suggestion in two parts. The first emerges from a claim in the conclusion:
 - a. "The development of oil palm under the pretext of poverty alleviation therefore tends to jeopardize the role, authority, and the overall existence of indigenous Papuans." Can you give more concrete evidence of this in the text. While I agree, after reading your paper I am still left wonder at: How did you arrive at this conclusion?
 - b. Similarly, you make this statement: "Oil palm expansion in West Papua has increasingly been seen to undermine goals laid in the Special Autonomy Law. The rapid growth of oil palm in West Papua is not accompanied by good governance, recognition, and capacity building of indigenous Papuans." Can you be more explicit in the text on how you arrived at this conclusion?
- 4) A final point I would like the authors to consider. In the second paragraph (intro) you mention that you will do three things in the paper. Did you deliver on all of these points? A more critical eye on this question could provide improved ideas for structure and empirical engagement in the paper.

On Sep 2, 2020, at 15:57, Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com> wrote:

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

2 attachments



Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua province_19112020.docx
229K



Response to reviewer's comment for FS manuscript_YR.docx
22K

Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu>

Sun, Nov 22, 2020 at 8:45 PM

To: Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>

Cc: Ahmad Maryudi <ahmad_maryudi@ugm.ac.id>, Dwiko Budi Permadi <dbpermadi@ugm.ac.id>, "Muhammad Alif K. Sahide" <alif.mksr@gmail.com>

Dear Authors,

Thank you for your resubmission.

We will inform you once the reviewers have commented on your responses and revisions, and upon which the editors have made a collective decision on the processing of your manuscript.

Many thanks,
Micah

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

<Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua province_19112020.docx><Response to reviewer's comment for FS manuscript_YR.docx>

Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu>

Thu, Dec 17, 2020 at 5:28 PM

To: Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>

Cc: Ahmad Maryudi <ahmad_maryudi@ugm.ac.id>, Dwiko Budi Permadi <dbpermadi@ugm.ac.id>, "Muhammad Alif K. Sahide" <alif.mksr@gmail.com>

Dear Authors,
Reviewer 1 has two remaining clarifications
Reviewer 2 is ok for publication.

I have also conducted some copy editing to the draft to improve some of the language. Please review and feel free to change or disregard.

One question: for the title did you mean "What lies ahead" or "What lies ahead?" with question mark?

Please fix this quickly so that we can publish immediately.

Congrats, and Thanks!
Micah

On Nov 19, 2020, at 18:06, Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear the Editor,

On behalf of all authors, I would like to submit the revised version of our paper. I would like to sincerely thank you for the constructive comments provided. The details of how we revised the paper provided in a separate sheer (response to reviewers). We are confident the paper is in a better shape now. We are looking forward to receiving a positive decision. Thank you.

Sincerely,
Authors

On Thu, Oct 29, 2020 at 2:05 PM Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu> wrote:

Dear Authors,

Thank you for your timely submission of this policy brief.

We have received two reviewer comments for your submission.

Given these encouraging reviews, as editor, I have decided to accept your article with minor submissions. I also provided some additional copy editing directly in the draft in anticipation of publication, attached:

Please find the reviewer comments attached directly in the form as track changes, as well as some overall comments listed below:

Many thanks, and we look forward to your resubmission.

Micah

REVIEWER 1

Introduction:

Need to better explain the distinction on the geography of oil palm plantations. As they are mostly using lowland tropical forest, therefore they result in significant losses of biodiversity. Please expand on this point to provide better context.

In addition – please include additional data about plants and animals which are at most risk.

You should also seek to be more specific about why oil palm plantations are expanding in West Papua? Why are they increasing and what are the processes that result in the rapid increase in recent years?

How is the West Papua commitment as “Provinsi Konservasi ” in terms of reviewing these licensing procedures and approvals, especially on oil palm plantation?

Does the government have a strong commitment or lack the capacity for concession processes, and why are they promoting oil palm concessions? Can you also expand more on the internal conflicts within the government on plantation approval or those against it?

Why are local governments not promoting other forms of concessions that might be more locally appropriate, such as developing local products such as Sago, Casava, Taro, or buah merah, rather than choosing oil palm plantation?

In section 2:

The data on conflict is interesting but could do a better job of listing out additional conflicts.

Here is some additional information:

-Conflict Between Pt Mitra Silva Lestari, PT Papua Sawit permai and contradicting concession area with local people and local government in Manokwari selatan)
 -also Awyu Ethnic group in Boven Digoel demonstrated on 28 Agustus 2020 to ask the Bupati Boven digoel to stop oil plantations. Those company areas include: PT Indo Asiana Lestari, Pt Graha Kencana Mulia, PT Kartika Cipta Pratama, PT Boven Digoel Budiaya Sentosa, Pt Boven Digeol Abadi, PT Perkebunan Digeol Sejahtera)

REVIEWER 2:

Thank you for this excellent contribution to the literature on a topic we know very little about. This article provides timely engagement on a topic with little empirical material and does a good job of drawing attention to the issue. We hope that this policy forum paper will help to draw attention and encourage more research on this topic.

Overall the article is in a very good condition to merit publication, especially as a policy forum article.

However, there are some key areas that would help to improve the paper.

1) There are key sections of missed pronouns “it” which create confusion on the subject of the sentence. Please try to be clearer on which perspective or points are being raised here. I have noted most of these directly in the attached text.

2) The paper would also benefit from adding additional case studies. Particularly on the issues of customary conflicts, the points would be significantly improved by case examples. I have also noted these throughout the text.

3) There is one fundamental area for improvement for the paper that should be the focus of the revision process. I make this suggestion in two parts. The first emerges from a claim in the conclusion:

a. "The development of oil palm under the pretext of poverty alleviation therefore tends to jeopardize the role, authority, and the overall existence of indigenous Papuans." Can you give more concrete evidence of this in the text. While I agree, after reading your paper I am still left wonder at: How did you arrive at this conclusion?

b. Similarly, you make this statement: "Oil palm expansion in West Papua has increasingly been seen to undermine goals laid in the Special Autonomy Law. The rapid growth of oil palm in West Papua is not accompanied by good governance, recognition, and capacity building of indigenous Papuans." Can you be more explicit in the text on how you arrived at this conclusion?

4) A final point I would like the authors to consider. In the second paragraph (intro) you mention that you will do three things in the paper. Did you deliver on all of these points? A more critical eye on this question could provide improved ideas for structure and empirical engagement in the paper.

On Sep 2, 2020, at 15:57, Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Editor,

I am writing to submit our manuscript (attached files) entitled, "Palm Oil Plantation, Forest Conservation and Indigenous People in West Papua; What Lies Ahead," for consideration for publication in the Journal of Forest and Society. Since our manuscript related to a special section of the Journal, hopefully, it would draw the interest of society who read your journal.

This manuscript describes our work and is not under consideration by any other journal. All authors approved the manuscript and this submission.

Thank you for receiving our manuscript and considering it for review. We appreciate your time and look forward to your response.

Kind regards,
on behalf of all authors,

Yubelince Runtuboi
(Corresponding author)
<Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua
Province_02092020.docx><Cover letter.docx>

<Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua province_19112020.docx><Response to reviewer's comment for FS manuscript_YR.docx>



Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua province_19112020-input SF 6desember 2020 ROUND 2.doc
360K

Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>

Thu, Dec 24, 2020 at 10:38 AM

To: Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu>

Cc: Ahmad Maryudi <ahmad_maryudi@ugm.ac.id>, Dwiko Budi Permadi <dbpermadi@ugm.ac.id>, "Muhammad Alif K. Sahide" <alif.mksr@gmail.com>

Dear Editor,

On behalf of all authors, I would like to thank you very much for this positive news. I hereby send you the latest revised version of our paper. I want to sincerely thank you for your constructive comments. Details of how we revised the paper are given in a separate sheet (responses to reviewers). We assume the paper is in better shape now. We are looking forward to receiving a positive decision. Thank you.

Sincerely,
Authors

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

2 attachments



Response to reviewer's comment for FS manuscript_20122020.docx
15K



Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua province_20122020.doc
364K

Micah Fisher <micahrf@hawaii.edu>

Thu, Dec 24, 2020 at 3:28 PM

To: Yubelin Runtuboi <yrun tuboi@gmail.com>

Cc: Ahmad Maryudi <ahmad_maryudi@ugm.ac.id>, Dwiko Budi Permadi <dbpermadi@ugm.ac.id>, "Muhammad Alif K. Sahide" <alif.mksr@gmail.com>

Thanks, Authors,

We will process this for publication as soon as possible.

Thanks again for your excellent submission.

We hope you consider submitting again soon.

All the best,

Micah

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

<Response to reviewer's comment for FS manuscript_20122020.docx><Oil Palm_Forest Conservation&IndigenousPeople_West Papua province_20122020.doc>