



Ridwan S <ridwansala@gmail.com>

Reviewer Comments

Ayu Astuti <biodiv36@gmail.com>

Fri, May 20, 2022 at 1:58 AM

To: ridwansala@gmail.com, e_manangkalangi2013@yahoo.com

For author and editor

Reviewer A:

Dear Authors,

Thank you for submitting the interesting paper investigating the estimation of population parameters and fishery status of spotted scat in Pabean Bay, Indramayu. This is an interesting study from data in 2015 that identifies population parameters and importantly fishery status of spotted scat. There is some value to this paper from a fish population dynamic perspective.

There are some revisions required in order to consider this manuscript for publication. I have included sufficient specific feedback on the word document version of the manuscript, please find attached. Make sure that any changes to the manuscript are shown using highlighted text. Additionally, please address the following key areas when making revisions:

1. Sample size. Describe how fish were selected i.e. from field or landing sites. This needs to be considered in some detail in the method.
2. Results. Could you provide some more details on the information provided by the range. For example, mean+/- SD with associated n.
3. References. I have added a few key references as examples. Do not feel exhaustive to add a few more to improve the quality and strengthen the manuscript.
4. Proof read. I have recommended some suggestions for wording in terms of spelling and grammar.

Recommendation: Revisions Required

Virus-free. www.avast.com

2 attachments

**11118-1052574-1-5-20220514 (1).docx**

14K



11118-1052573-1-5-20220514 (1).doc

3867K



Ridwan S <ridwansala@gmail.com>

[biodiv] Editor Decision

Smujo Editors <smujo.id@gmail.com>

Wed, May 25, 2022 at 3:25 PM

To: Emmanuel Manangkalangi <e_manangkalangi2013@yahoo.com>, I Nyoman Dati Pertami <dati_pertami@yahoo.co.id>, Aries Asriansyah <aries.asriansyah@gmail.com>, "Reiza M. Aditriawan" <reizasc@gmail.com>, Ridwan Sala <ridwansala@gmail.com>, "M. Fadjar Rahardjo" <mf.rahardjo@gmail.com>

Emmanuel Manangkalangi, I Nyoman Dati Pertami, Aries Asriansyah, Reiza M. Aditriawan, Ridwan Sala, M. Fadjar Rahardjo:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity, "Estimation of population parameters and fishery status of *Scatophagus argus* (Scatophagidae) in Pabean Bay, Indramayu, West Java".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Reviewer A:

Attention authors:

Make a clean version of revised manuscript with highlighted changes and correct format and double check additional statement according to right intention and resubmit for review. Without a clean version, a further delayed would be applied.

Recommendation: See Comments

[Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity](#)



B-Submit ToBiodiversity_Ver3.doc

3873K



Ridwan S <ridwansala@gmail.com>

[biodiv] Editor Decision

Ayu Astuti <smujo.id@gmail.com>

Sat, Jun 4, 2022 at 5:34 PM

To: Emmanuel Manangkalangi <e_manangkalangi2013@yahoo.com>, I Nyoman Dati Pertami <dati_pertami@yahoo.co.id>, Aries Asriansyah <aries.asriansyah@gmail.com>, "Reiza M. Aditriawan" <reizasc@gmail.com>, Ridwan Sala <ridwansala@gmail.com>, "M. Fadjar Rahardjo" <mf.rahardjo@gmail.com>

Emmanuel Manangkalangi, I Nyoman Dati Pertami, Aries Asriansyah, Reiza M. Aditriawan, Ridwan Sala, M. Fadjar Rahardjo:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity, "Estimation of population parameters and fishery status of *Scatophagus argus* (Scatophagidae) in Pabean Bay, Indramayu, West Java".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Reviewer A:

Authors,

Thank you for submitting the 2nd revised version. However, there are some revisions required in order to consider this manuscript for publication. I have included specific feedback on the word document version of the manuscript, please find attached. Make sure that any changes to the manuscript are shown using highlighted text. Additionally, please address the following key areas when making revisions:

1. Methods.

Line 69: Describe how samples were selected from the collection as it is said samples in this line. Were all collected individuals treated as samples?

Line 75: This sentence indicates that no samples selection. Did survey team collect samples every day in the landing site? Describe frequency of fish collected at landing site in Pabean bay in monthly basis as there is a date in each graph presented in Figure 2.

2. The current results and discussion

Line 147-148: Define as the current statement is a general one.

lines 149-151 are not well-explained. Link it with first recruitment and the size of the 1st time caught. This needs to be considered in some detail in the discussion and conclusion based on the results.


3. Proof read. I have edited many incorrect grammatical errors and provided some suggestions for wording.

Recommendation: Revisions Required

Recommendation: Revisions Required

[Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity](#)

2 attachments

 **A-11118-Article Text-1053291-1-4-20220526_2ndReview.doc**
3886K

 **A-Feedback_Reviewer11118_2nd.docx**
16K



Ridwan S <ridwansala@gmail.com>

[biodiv] Editor Decision

Smujo Editors <smujo.id@gmail.com>

Mon, Jul 11, 2022 at 4:42 PM

To: EMMANUEL MANANGKALANGI <e_manangkalangi2013@yahoo.com>, I NYOMAN DATI PERTAMI <dati_pertami@yahoo.co.id>, ARIES ASRIANSYAH <aries.asriansyah@gmail.com>, REIZA MAULANA ADITRIAWAN <reizascscs@gmail.com>, RIDWAN SALA <ridwansala@gmail.com>, MUHAMMAD FADJAR RAHARDJO <mf.rahardjo@gmail.com>

EMMANUEL MANANGKALANGI, I NYOMAN DATI PERTAMI, ARIES ASRIANSYAH, REIZA MAULANA ADITRIAWAN, RIDWAN SALA, MUHAMMAD FADJAR RAHARDJO:

The editing of your submission, "Estimation of population parameters and fishery status of spotted scat, *Scatophagus argus* (Scatophagidae) in Pabean Bay, Indramayu, West Java, Indonesia," is complete. We are now sending it to production.

Submission URL: <https://smujo.id/biodiv/authorDashboard/submission/11118>

[Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity](#)



Ridwan S <ridwansala@gmail.com>

[biodiv] Editor Decision

Smujo Editors <smujo.id@gmail.com>

Mon, Jun 13, 2022 at 10:18 PM

To: Emmanuel Manangkalangi <e_manangkalangi2013@yahoo.com>, I Nyoman Dati Pertami <dati_pertami@yahoo.co.id>, Aries Asriansyah <aries.asriansyah@gmail.com>, "Reiza M. Aditriawan" <reizasc@gmail.com>, Ridwan Sala <ridwansala@gmail.com>, "M. Fadjar Rahardjo" <mf.rahardjo@gmail.com>

Emmanuel Manangkalangi, I Nyoman Dati Pertami, Aries Asriansyah, Reiza M. Aditriawan, Ridwan Sala, M. Fadjar Rahardjo:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity, "Estimation of population parameters and fishery status of *Scatophagus argus* (Scatophagidae) in Pabean Bay, Indramayu, West Java".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Reviewer A:

Reviewer A
Authors,

Thank you for submitting the 2nd revised version. However, still there are some revisions required in order to consider this manuscript for publication. I have included specific feedback on the word document version of the manuscript, please find attached. Make sure that any changes to the manuscript are shown using highlighted text and make it as a clean revised version. Additionally, please address the following key areas when making revisions:

1. Introduction.

Line 34: Revise as it is unclear what This refers to.

2. Materials and Methods

Line 67: Describe in brief how sero and gill nets were used in sampling effort. How many fishers were assigned to sampling in each sampling station? Were numbers and fishers the same in each month?

Line 67-68: Why authors did not test size variation among three sample stations to assess whether their sampling efforts are representative?

3. The current results and discussion

Line 109: Describe in the method section how sampling dates were selected: Purposively or just random?

Lines 150: Understandable for same pattern but authors are welcome to elaborate and strengthen it in relation to time as well.


4. Proof read. I have edited many incorrect grammatical errors and provided some suggestions for wording.

Recommendation: Revisions Required

Recommendation: Revisions Required

[Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity](#)

2 attachments

 **A-11118-Article Text-1054107-1-4-20220606_3rdReviewed.doc**
3810K

 **A-Feedback_Reviewer11118_3rd.docx**
16K



Ridwan S <ridwansala@gmail.com>

[biodiv] Editor Decision

1 message

Ayu Astuti <smujo.id@gmail.com>

Wed, Jun 29, 2022 at 12:21 AM

To: EMMANUEL MANANGKALANGI <e_manangkalangi2013@yahoo.com>, I NYOMAN DATI PERTAMI <dati_pertami@yahoo.co.id>, ARIES ASRIANSYAH <aries.asriansyah@gmail.com>, REIZA MAULANA ADITRIAWAN <reizasc@gmail.com>, RIDWAN SALA <ridwansala@gmail.com>, MUHAMMAD FADJAR RAHARDJO <mf.rahardjo@gmail.com>

EMMANUEL MANANGKALANGI, I NYOMAN DATI PERTAMI, ARIES ASRIANSYAH, REIZA MAULANA ADITRIAWAN, RIDWAN SALA, MUHAMMAD FADJAR RAHARDJO:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity, "Estimation of population parameters and fishery status of spotted scat, *Scatophagus argus* (Scatophagidae) in Pabean Bay, Indramayu, West Java, Indonesia".

Our decision is to: Accept Submission

[Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity](#)